

City of San Diego Photo Enforcement System Review Final Report

CONFIDENTIAL

Submitted to:

City of San Diego Police Department

Submitted by:

PB Farradyne Inc.

In association with:

Darnell & Associates

January 14, 2002

The contents of this Interim Report are CONFIDENTIAL.

The data and information presented in the report may be shared only with persons or individuals who have executed the required Confidentiality Agreement.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	
1.0 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 BACKGROUND.....	1
1.1.1 System Description.....	2
1.1.2 Method of Operation.....	3
1.1.3 Red Light Photo Enforcement Locations.....	4
1.2 REPORT ORGANIZATION.....	5
2.0 RED LIGHT RUNNING AND ACCIDENTS.....	7
2.1 RED LIGHT RUNNING VIOLATIONS BEFORE AND AFTER ENFORCEMENT.....	7
2.2 ACCIDENTS BEFORE AND AFTER PHOTO ENFORCEMENT.....	10
2.3 RA/RS ACCIDENT BEFORE AND AFTER PHOTO ENFORCEMENT.....	11
2.3.1 RA/RS Accident Rate Change By Movement Type.....	12
2.3.2 RA/RS Accident Rate Change By Intersection Type.....	12
2.3.3 Before And After RA/RS Accident Rate Change By Intersection.....	14
2.4 NON RA/RS ACCIDENTS BEFORE AND AFTER PHOTO ENFORCEMENT.....	16
2.4.1 Overall Re Accident Rate Change.....	16
2.4.2 Average Rear End Accident Rate Change By Traffic Movement.....	17
2.4.3 Average Rear End Accident Rate Change for Through Movement Enforced Intersections.....	17
2.4.4 Average Rear End Accident Rate Change for Left Turn Movement Enforced Intersections.....	18
2.4.5 Longer Run Rear End Accident Rate Change.....	19
2.5 COMPARISON WITH OTHER PHOTO ENFORCEMENT PROGRAMS.....	20
2.6 FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	21
3.0 PHOTO ENFORCEMENT EQUIPMENT INSTALLATIONS.....	23
3.1 VERIFICATION METHODOLOGY.....	23
3.2 VERIFICATION OF IMPROVEMENT PLANS BY LOCATION....	23
3.3 WARNING SIGNS.....	28
3.4 LOOP PLACEMENT MEASUREMENTS.....	28
3.5 VEHICLE DETECTION RELATED ERRORS.....	29
3.5.1 Long Pitch Error.....	30
3.5.2 Short Pitch Error.....	32
3.5.3 Cosine Error.....	33
3.5.4 Errors Due to Acceleration Between Stop Bar and Second Loop.....	36

San Diego Photo Enforcement System Review

3.5.5	Errors Due to Deceleration Between Stop Bar and Second Loop.....	36
3.5.6	Examples for the Worst Case Errors.....	37
3.6	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PHOTO ENFORCEMENT EQUIPMENT INSTALLATIONS.....	37
4.0	CAMERA UNIT SETUPS.....	39
4.1	METHODOLOGY FOR FIELD INSPECTIONS.....	39
4.2	DATA COLLECTION PROCEDURES.....	40
4.2.1	Internal Measurements.....	40
4.2.2	External Measurements.....	41
4.2.3	Camera Pole and Housing.....	41
4.2.4	Camera Unit Information and Settings.....	42
4.3	FIELD INSPECTION RESULTS.....	43
4.3.1	Camera Pole and Cabinet.....	43
4.3.2	Internal Camera Unit Settings.....	45
4.3.3	Camera Unit Pitch Settings.....	50
4.3.4	Camera Unit Delay Time Settings.....	51
4.3.5	Camera Unit Minimum Speed Settings.....	52
4.3.6	External Camera Unit Settings and Data.....	52
4.3.7	Camera Settings and Data.....	53
4.3.8	Auxiliary Flash.....	56
4.3.9	Camera and Detector Operations.....	57
4.4	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CAMERA UNIT SETUPS.....	58
5.0	REVIEW OF PHOTOGRAPHIC DATA.....	60
5.1	VIOLATIONS DATA BASE.....	60
5.2	DATA ANALYSIS METHOD.....	63
5.3	ANALYSIS OF LIGHTING/OPTICAL FACTORS.....	65
5.3.1	Windshield Glare.....	65
5.3.2	Clarity of Driver/Dark Vehicle Interiors.....	66
5.4	ANALYSIS OF GEOMETRIC FACTORS.....	68
5.4.1	Driver Obstruction.....	68
5.4.2	Vehicle And License Plate Obstruction.....	69
5.5	ANALYSIS OF FRAMING FACTORS.....	70
5.6	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	72
6.0	TRAFFIC ENGINEERING AND TRAFFIC OPERATIONS IMPROVEMENTS.....	74
6.1	YELLOW CHANGE INTERVAL.....	74
6.1.1	Verification of Yellow Change Intervals.....	75
6.1.2	Longer Yellow Change Intervals.....	78
6.2	RED CLEARANCE INTERVAL.....	79
6.3	RED LIGHT RUNNING ALTERNATIVE MEASURES.....	79
6.3.1	Enhanced Advance Warning Signs.....	80
6.3.2	Advanced Flashing Yellow Light Installation.....	80
6.3.3	In Pavement Warning Lights.....	81
6.3.4	Cross Street Green Delay Time.....	81

San Diego Photo Enforcement System Review

6.3.5	Coordinated Traffic Signal Operations.....	81
6.3.6	Recap.....	82
6.4	TOP PRIORITY INTERSECTIONS FOR TRAFFIC SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS.....	82
6.5	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	82
7.0	SYSTEM POLICIES AND MANAGEMENT.....	84
7.1	METHODOLOGY.....	84
7.2	PHOTO ENFORCEMENT SYSTEM OPERATIONS.....	84
7.3	PHOTO ENFORCEMENT SYSTEM MAINTENANCE.....	86
7.4	PUBLIC AWARENESS AND INFORMATION.....	86
7.5	PROGRAM COORDINATION.....	88
7.5.1	Re-Engineered Photo Enforcement Equipment Installations.....	88
7.5.2	Public Awareness and Information Campaign.....	89
7.5.3	City Design and Construction Review Program Objectives.....	89
7.5.4	Program Objectives.....	89
7.5.5	On-Going Problem Identification and Analysis.....	90
7.5.6	Traffic Safety Partnership.....	90
7.5.7	Program Expansion.....	91
 APPENDIX A RED LIGHT CAMERA SITE INSPECTION DATA		
APPENDIX B PHOTO ENFORCED INTERSECTION DRAWINGS		
APPENDIX C VIOLATION TREND AT PHOTO ENFORCED INTERSECTIONS		
APPENDIX D PHOTO ENFORCEMENT GRACE PERIOD COMPUTATIONS		

LIST OF TABLES

		Page
Table 1-1	PHOTO ENFORCEMENT LOCATIONS.....	4
Table 1-2	REPORT ORGANIZATION.....	6
Table 2-1	PHOTO-ENFORCED INTERSECTIONS GROUPED BY NUMBER OF MONTHS IN OPERATION.....	8
Table 2-2	PHOTO-ENFORCED INTERSECTIONS GROUPED BY LEFT TURN VERSUS THROUGH ENFORCEMENT AND NUMBER OF MONTHS IN OPERATION.....	9
Table 2-3	REDUCTIONS IN RED LIGHT RUNNING VIOLATIONS AND COLLISIONS FOR SELECTED PHTO ENFORCEMENT PROGRAMS.....	21
Table 3-1	CAMERA LOOP PLACEMENT MEASUREMENTS.....	29
Table 3-2	MINIMUM DISTANCE FOR SPEEDING UP TO 15 MPH.....	36
Table 4-1	INSPECTION RECORD.....	39
Table 4-2	POLE TYPE MODEL AND CONDITIONS.....	47
Table 4-3	PHOTO ENFORCEMENT CAMERA TYPES AND IDENTIFICATION.....	48
Table 4-4	INTERNAL CAMERA UNIT SETTINGS.....	49
Table 4-5	COMPARISON OF CAMERA SETUP PITCH SETTINGS AND FIELD MEASUREMENTS.....	51
Table 4-6	CAMERA UNIT DELAY TIME SETTINGS FOR SELECTED PHOTO ENFORCEMENT PROGRAMS.....	52
Table 4-7	CAMERA UNIT MINIMUM SPEED SETTINGS FOR SELECTED PHOTO ENFORCEMENT PROGRAMS.....	53
Table 4-8	EXTERNAL CAMERA UNIT SETTINGS AND DATA.....	54
Table 4-9	CAMERA SETTINGS.....	55
Table 4-10	AUXILIARY FLASH DATA.....	57
Table 5-1	DISPOSITION OF PHOTOGRAPHED VIOLATIONS FROM SEPTEMBER 1998 THROUGH JUNE 2001.....	61
Table 5-2	RECLASSIFICATION OF INTERSECTION RELATED FACTORS.....	64
Table 6-1	SUMMARY OF SIGNAL TIMING, SPEED AND SIGNAL CYCLES AT PHOTO-ENFORCED INTERSECTIONS.....	76
Table 6-2	SUMMARY OF YELLOW CHANGE INTERVALS.....	77
Table 6-3	RED LIGHT RUNNING DRIVER TYPES AND POSSIBLE COUNTERMEASURES.....	80
Table 6-4	SUMMARY OF SELECTED ENGINEERING COUNTERMEASURES.....	82
Table 7-1	PUBLIC AWARENESS AND EDUCATION CAMPAIGN ELEMENTS USED BY SELECTED PHOTO ENFORCEMENT PROGRAMS.....	87

LIST OF FIGURES

		Page
Figure 1-1	VIEW OF PHOTO-ENFORCED INTERSECTION.....	2
Figure 2-1	OBSERVED REDUCTIONS IN RED LIGHT RUNNING VIOLATIONS.....	9
Figure 2-2	AVERAGE NUMBER OF VIOLATIONS PER MONTH BY LEFT TURN VERSUS THROUGH ENFORCEMENT.....	10
Figure 2-3	CHANGE IN ACCIDENT RATES BEFORE AND AFTER PHOTO ENFORCEMENT BY TYPE OF ACCIDENT.....	11
Figure 2-4	RA/RS ACCIDENT RATE CHANGE BY TRAFFIC MOVEMENTS.....	12
Figure 2-5	ACCIDENT RATES FOR INTERSECTIONS WHERE THROUGH MOVEMENTS ENFORCED AND LEFT TURN MOVEMENTS ENFORCED.....	13
Figure 2-6	ACCIDENT RATES FOR ENFORCED AND NON-ENFORCED MOVEMENTS AT INTERSECTIONS WHERE THROUGH MOVEMENTS ENFORCED.....	13
Figure 2-7	ACCIDENT RATES FOR ENFORCED AND NON-ENFORCED MOVEMENTS AT INTERSECTIONS WHERE LEFT TURN MOVEMENTS ENFORCED.....	14
Figure 2-8	BEFORE PHOTO ENFORCEMENT ACCIDENT RATES AT PHOTO-ENFORCED INTERSECTIONS.....	15
Figure 2-9	AFTER PHOTO ENFORCEMENT ACCIDENT RATES AT PHOTO-ENFORCED INTERSECTIONS.....	15
Figure 2-10	AVERAGE ACCIDENT RATES CHANGE BY ACCIDENT TYPES.....	16
Figure 2-11	AVERAGE ACCIDENT RATES CHANGE BY TRAFFIC MOVEMENT.....	17
Figure 2-12	REAR END ACCIDENT RATES FOR ENFORCED AND NON-ENFORCED MOVEMENTS AT INTERSECTIONS WHERE THROUGH MOVEMENTS ENFORCED.....	18
Figure 2-13	REAR END ACCIDENT RATES FOR ENFORCED AND NON-ENFORCED MOVEMENTS AT INTERSECTIONS WHERE LEFT TURN MOVEMENTS ENFORCED.....	19
Figure 2-14	LONGER RUN REAR END ACCIDENT RATES CHANGE.....	20
Figure 3-1	LONG PITCH LENGTH ERROR.....	31
Figure 3-2	SHORT PITCH LENGTH ERROR.....	33
Figure 3-3	EXAMPLES OF POSSIBLE COSINE ERRORS.....	34
Figure 3-4	MINIMUM AND MAXIMUM PITCH LENGTHS OF COSINE ERROR.....	35
Figure 3-5	PHOTO ENFORCEMENT ENHANCED ADVANCE WARNING SIGN.....	38
Figure 4-1	CAMERA POLE AND HOUSING.....	36
Figure 4-2	CAMERA HOUSING.....	42
Figure 4-3	INSIDE VIEW OF CAMERA HOUSING SHOWING CAMERA UNIT.....	43

San Diego Photo Enforcement System Review

Figure 4-4	LOWERED HINGED POLE.....	44
Figure 4-5	LOWERED ELEVATOR POLE.....	44
Figure 4-6	EL 250 AUXILIARY FLASH.....	56
Figure 4-7	EL 500 AUXILIARY FLASH.....	56
Figure 4-8	TYPICAL LOOP ARRANGEMENT.....	58
Figure 5-1	BREAKDOWN OF CITATIONS NOT ISSUED BY FACTOR.....	62
Figure 5-2	PERCENT CITATIONS ISSUED BY INTERSECTION.....	63
Figure 5-3	AVERAGE MONTHLY NUMBER OF VIOLATIONS AND CITATIONS ISSUED BY PHOTO ENFORCED INTERSECTION.....	64
Figure 5-4	CITATIONS NOT ISSUED DUE TO WINDSHIELD GLARE.....	65
Figure 5-5	CITATIONS NOT ISSUED DUE TO DARK VEHICLE INTERIOR.....	67
Figure 5-7	CITATIONS NOT ISSUED DUE TO POOR CLARITY OF DRIVER.....	68
Figure 5-8	CITATIONS NOT ISSUED DUE TO DRIVER OBSTRUCTED...	69
Figure 5-9	CITATIONS NOT ISSUED DUE TO LICENSE PLATE AND VEHICLE OBSTRUCTION.....	70
Figure 5-10	CITATIONS NOT ISSUED DUE TO FRAMING.....	71
Figure 5-11	CITATIONS NOT ISSUED FOR OBSTRUCTION AND FRAMING FACTORS BY TYPE OF ENFORCEMENT.....	72
Figure 6-1	VIOLATIONS DATA FOR SELECTED PHOTO ENFORCED INTERSECTIONS BEFORE AND AFTER YELLOW CHANGE INTERVAL MODIFICATIONS.....	79
Figure 7-1	CURB-BASED DIGITAL PHOTO ENFORCEMENT CAMERA SYSTEM.....	93
Figure 7-2	OVERHEAD DIGITAL PHOTO ENFORCEMENT CAMERA SYSTEM.....	93